

**CS1/06-0204**

---

**INCITS**

**InterNational Committee for Information Technology Standards**

INCITS Secretariat, Information Technology Industry Council (ITI)

1250 Eye St. NW, Suite 200, Washington, DC 20005

Telephone 202-737-8888; Fax 202-638-4922

Date: September 5, 2006

Replaces: n/a

Reply to: Deborah J. Spittle

Phone: (202) 626-5746

Email: [dspittle@itic.org](mailto:dspittle@itic.org)

---

**Draft Minutes**

**INCITS Task Group CS1.1, Role-Based Access Control (RBAC)**

**Meeting Number 4**

August 14, 2006

8:30 a.m. – 3pm

Lecture Room B in Building 101 1st Floor (Admin Bldg.).

National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST)

Gaithersburg, MD 20899

Agenda Point of Contact:

Ed Coyne

703-408-1871

[ed.coyne@va.gov](mailto:ed.coyne@va.gov)

---

**1. Administrative Matters (E. Coyne)**

**1.1 Call to Order**

Mr. Coyne called the meeting to order at 8:40 AM

**1.2 Roll call of participants**

Mr. Coyne called the roll of members present at NIST and via teleconference. Attendees indicated whether they would be Principal (voting) members or Advisory members. There were enough voting members present for a quorum of 4 to approve minutes or draft agenda. Meeting quorum established.

### 1.3 Membership in Attendance

Attendee	Organization	Membership	Contact Information
Dan Benigni	NIST	Ex-officio	NIST 100 Bureau Drive Stop 8930 Gaithersburg MD 20899-8930 301-975-3279 dbenigni@nist.gov
Bob Blakely	IBM	Alternate	IBM Corporation 11501 Burnet Road Austin TX 78758 bblakely@us.ibm.com
Dr. Ed Coyne	VHA HIA	Voting Principal	VHA Health Information Architecture Office 2407 Jackson Parkway Vienna VA 22180 703-408-1871 ed.coyne@va.gov
David Hemsath	IBM	Voting Principal	IBM Corporation 11501 Burnet Road Austin TX 78758 512 838-0813 dhemsath@us.ibm.com
Mike Hogan	NIST	Alternate	NIST 100 Bureau Drive Stop 8900 Gaithersburg MD 20899-8900 301-975-2926 301-975-2378 m.hogan@nist.gov
Dr. Axel Kern	Beta Systems	Alternate	BetaSystems Software AG Alt-Moabit 90d D-10559 Berlin Germany axel.kern@betasystems.com
Rich Kissel	NIST	Alternate	NIST 100 Bureau Drive Stop 8930 Gaithersburg, MD 20899-8930 301-975-5017 rkissel@nist.gov
Dr. Martin Kuhlmann	Beta Systems	Principal	Beta Systems Software AG Josef-Lammerting-Allee 14 50933 Koln Germany <a href="mailto:Martin.kuhlmann@betasystems.com">Martin.kuhlmann@betasystems.com</a>
Rick Kuhn	NIST	Voting Principal	NIST 100 Bureau Drive Stop 8930 Gaithersburg, MD 20899-8930 301-975-3337 kuhn@nist.gov
Thomas Raeuchle	Prodigen	Principal	Prodigen 5608 International Parkway New Hope Mn 55428 direct 763-557-9900 cell 612-269-3266 traeuchle@prodigen.com
Tim Weil	BAH	Voting Principal	Booz   Allen   Hamilton 8251 Greensboro Drive - Suite 511 McLean, Va. 22102 703-377-0948 301-452-3641 weil_tim@bah.com
Jerry Thrasher	Lexmark	Observer	thrasher@lexmark.com

#### **1.4 Appointment of recording secretary**

Mr. Weil agreed to be recording secretary.

#### **1.5 INCITS Antitrust Guidelines**

REF: <http://www.incits.org/inatrust.htm>

Mr. Coyne described the significance of the INCITS Antitrust Guidelines and noted the reference for review by members.

#### **1.6 Document Distribution**

REF: CS1/06-0055

REF: CS1/06-0057

REF: CS1/06-0138

REF: SC27 N5205 – Framework for Identity Management

#### **2. Approval of Draft Agenda**

REF:CS1/05-0165

Discussion of the SC27 N5205 – Framework for Identity Management as relevant to the agenda.

The following motion was made:

Motion: “Approve the agenda as modified by the addition of four documents to agenda item 3.”

Moved: T. Weil

Seconded: R. Kuhn

Vote on the Motion: Approved by Unanimous Consent

#### **3. Approval of Minutes of Last Meetings (31 Jan 06), (3 May 06)**

Motion: “Approve the minutes of the previous 2 meetings, for those of January 31, 2006, and May 3, 2006”

Vote on the Motion: Approved by Unanimous Consent

#### **4. INCITS Project 1794 - Review documents and current work related to formulating a standard on role-based access control implementation requirements**

REF: CS1/06-0057 Draft Standard for Implementation of RBAC

**REF: CS1/06-0132 Draft RBAC Use Cases**

The current draft RBAC implementation standard was reviewed section by section and commented upon. Changes were incorporated into a working copy that will be distributed to the Task Group members for further review.

**5. Review of January v0.1 2006 Standard (CS1/06-0057)**

- Table of Contents Reviewed (no comments)
- Mandatory vs. Optional Standards in ANSI
  - Conformance clauses not addressed (addressed in ISO TR 10000 – OSI)

Mike Hogan recommends a Conformance Standard.  
Conformance clause from -359 added

PEP/PDP – ISO 10000-181-3 Definitions added to Terms and Definitions Section – from ANSI 359

Discussion of Tabular Options from the current draft

**DRAFT**

42

**Table 1. Options for Inclusion of Components**

Component	Option							
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Core RBAC	•	•	•	•	•	•	•	•
Hierarchical RBAC		•				•	•	•
Static Separation of Duty (SSD) Relations			•		•	•		•
Dynamic Separation of Duties (DSD) Relations				•	•		•	•

43

Recommendation to streamline the Components table to only represent Core RBAC features –

- STD-6.1 Core RBAC
  - STD-6.1.1 Administrative
    - Commands for Core RBAC
  - STD-6.1.2 Supporting System
    - Functions for Core RBAC
  - STD-6.1.3 Review Functions for Core RBAC
  - STD-6.1.4 Advanced Review
    - Functions for Core RBAC

CS1.1 Draft Implementation standard renamed to reflect CORE RBAC focus.

Recommended procedures (M. Hogan) for update to the Version 0.2. Call for contributions before October 2<sup>nd</sup> (Atlanta) CS1 meeting.

## 5. Other Business

- Possible new projects – Enterprise Dynamic Access Control (EDAC), role engineering. Role engineering proposal not written, but we have a draft for EDAC.
- Ed asked for other areas that have some interest.

## 6. Review Action Items from this Meeting

- Confirm schedule for future meetings – next for 2 October, with CS1 meeting.
- Update to the -0057 Working Standard Version 0.2. Call for contributions before October 2<sup>nd</sup> (Atlanta) CS1 meeting.
- Prodigen/Booz Allen representatives to discuss “What are the Business Engineering Processes which successfully lead to the Core RBAC implementation”
- BetaSystems Representatives to review working Draft at 9/22/06 IdM conference in Washington DC.
- 

## 7. Future Meetings

Planned CS1 and CS1.1 meetings:

CS1.1	1/31/06	San Jose, CA
CS1	2/1-2/06	San Jose, CA
CS1	3/29-30/06	Austin, TX
CS1.1	5/3/06 at NIST	Gaithersburg, MD
CS1.1	8/14/06 at NIST	Gaithersburg, MD
CS1	8/15-16/06 at NIST	Gaithersburg, MD
CS1.1	10/2/06	Atlanta, GA
CS1	10/3-4/06	Atlanta, GA

## 8. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 3:53 pm.

Note: Meeting notes are attached