

Reference number of document: ISO/IEC JTC1/SC17/WG1 N **1698**

Date of registration: 2007-08-10

Committee identification: ISO/IEC JTC1/SC17/WG1

Secretariat: Steve Brunt Consultancy s.i.brunt@ieee.org for BSI

Title : Disposition of Comments on ISO/IEC FCD 14443-1:2007

Author/Submitter : Steve Brunt, Project Editor ISO/IEC 14443-1

Requested action : for information/checking

Document type: WG1 Committee Document

Document subtype: N/A

Document stage: N/A

Document language: English

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-08-10	Document: 17n3272 Ballot Result for ISO/IEC FCD 14443-1
------------------	--

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
* *			ed	The document title uses incorrect English.	Replace "circuit(s)" with "circuit". Note that this correction has already been made in the latest edition of the ISO/IEC 7816 series.	Accepted: Amended the title but also 3.1 and 3.3.
* *			ed	The acronym PICC is defined nowhere in the document.	Give the full form in 3.6.	Rejected: PICC is no longer an acronym since it also applied to "format free" objects. See also comment AT.1
* *	2		ed	A normative reference fulfils the following criteria: 1. The user is obliged to consult it in order to apply 14443-1. 2. It is cited in 14443-1 in a way which makes it clear that the user is obliged to consult it in order to apply 14443-1 (e.g. "x shall be done in accordance with ISO 1234." or "The requirements of ISO 1234 apply."). References of the type "See ISO 1234." are purely informative and do not make ISO 1234 a normative reference. 3. It is publicly available.	With the exception of ISO/IEC 10373-6:2001, the documents listed in Clause 2 are not cited appropriately elsewhere in the document. Please review whether it is essential to consult them in order to apply ISO/IEC 14443-1; if so, change the way in which they are cited in the body of the document; otherwise, move them to a bibliography after Annex B.	Accepted: ISO/IEC 7810 (referred to in the definitions and in 4.1), ISO/IEC 15457-1 (referred to in 4.1) and ISO/IEC 10373-6 (referred to in the body) have been retained. The others, including ISO/IEC 14443-2 (referred to only in a note) have been deleted.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-08-10	Document: 17n3272 Ballot Result for ISO/IEC FCD 14443-1
------------------	--

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
* *	3.4		ed	inadequate definition	Redraft definition. For example: 3.4 ID-1 size of identification card as defined in ISO/IEC 7810	Accepted: ID-1 one of several formats defined in ISO/IEC 7810 so this definition simply states that the ID-1 referred to in ISO/IEC 14443-1 is indeed the ID-1 defined in ISO/IEC 7810.
AT 1	Clause 3.6		ed	PICC is handled in ISO/IEC 14443-2 as "Symbol" and not as "term(s) and definition(s)	Make structure of ISO/IEC 14443-1 consistent with ISO/IEC 14443-2 Add "(Proximity card or object)" after PICC.	Accepted: Modified somewhat. Revised definition clarifies that PICC can be a contactless ICC or some other object that couples in proximity to the PCD.
AT 2	Clause 3.6		ed/te	"Power transfer" is missing for the definition of PICC	Add: "and power transfer" after "communication"	Accepted: Insertion made.
AT 3	Clause 4.4	First sentence	ed	Term "clause" is missing	Replace "to 4.1" by "to clause 4.1"	Rejected: A reference to "clause 4.1" would be incorrect. The form of the cross-reference is correct as it stands.
AT 4	Annex A.1	First paragraph	ed	Term "clause" is missing (two times)	Replace "in A.1.1" by "in clause A.1.1" Replace "in A.1.2" by "in clause A.1.2"	Rejected: The form of the cross-reference is correct as it stands.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-08-10	Document: 17n3272 Ballot Result for ISO/IEC FCD 14443-1
------------------	--

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
AT 5	Annex A.1.1	Second bullet	ed/te	Wording unclear	Replace "connection endings" by "connection to the endings of the antenna coil"	Accepted: Substitution made as proposed – except "ends" used in place of "endings" as being more conventional terminology English.
AT 6	Annex A.1.2		ed	Term "clause" is missing	Replace " 7.4" by "clause 7.4" or better remove the clause number 7.4 because it will most likely not stay this clause number in revision 2	Rejected: The form of the cross-reference is correct as it stands. This is a dated reference to the 2001 edition so the date will change at every revision as well as the 7.4 reference. The proposal contained in comment AT.7 provides (effectively) a solution.
AT 7	Annex A.1.2		ed	Is ISO/IEC 10373-6: 2001 clause 7.4 the correct reference?	Use a non dated reference	Accepted: Date and subclause references removed.
AT 8	Annex B	Last line	ed		Replace "Note – restrictions" by " NOTE Restrictions"	Accepted: "Note – " replaced with "NOTE " See also NOTE in 4.2.
FR1	Annex A	A.1	ed	Paragraph uses bold text	Use normal style	Accepted: Source file purged.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2007-08-10

Document: **17n3272 Ballot Result for ISO/IEC FCD 14443-1**

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
FR2	Annex A	A.1	ed	Consistency of the name "Class 1"	Use quotation marks for "Class1"	Accepted: "Class 1 used throughout.
FR3	Annex A	A.1.1	ed	The last 12 words should be in a new line, not in the 2 nd bullet (see WG8N1198 for original text)	Move "except for the connection endings , with a maximum area of 300 mm ² ." to a new line	Accepted: Text modified as requested
JP1	4.2		Te	The dimension "x 3 mm "of the PICC antenna is maximum value caused by warp of PICC.	Add note: "The dimension "x 3 mm "of the PICC antenna is maximum value caused by warp of PICC, and is not thickness of PICC".	Accepted: Note added. Illustration added.

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.