

DOC: M1/06-0437

Second Issues List and Action Items on AHGBEA Report

Item #	Subsection	Raised by	Issue or Item	Action:	Resolution	Date
Section 1 - Introduction						
1.1	General	Unidentified	What is the overview of? Is it the document or the problem?	Comments needed		
1.2	General	Unidentified	What are the assumptions for reading the document?	Comments needed		
Section 2 – Statement of the Problem						
2.1	General	Mrs. Tilton	What it is that we are trying to do?	Comments needed		
Section 3 – Study Methodology – currently none						
Section 4 – References						
4.1	General	Unidentified	Link references to content in document	Editor duty	Added “REF” Placeholders, Currently updating bib and linking to text	5/15/06
Section 5 – Biometric Authentication Concepts and Architectures						
5.1	General	Unidentified	Insert Diagram on Biometric Enrollment/Verification	Contributions needed	Both Diagrams Added to Section 5	5/13/06
5.2	General	Unidentified	What is the right term of verification?	Comments needed	Will use ISO 37 SD2	5/17/06
5.3	General	Unidentified	What is the right term of identification?	Comments needed	Will use ISO 37 SD2	5/17/06
5.4	General	Unidentified	Should the need for a claimed identity by means of a PIN be allowed?	Comments needed		
5.5	General	Unidentified	Review the Liaison Statement out of Kyoto resolution 4.2 as it relates to the rate of acceptable 1 in N for biometrics.	Contributions needed		

5.6	General	Unidentified	Is 1:N ever applicable in remote environment, and if so then where?	Contributions needed		
5.7	General	Unidentified	What is the role of privacy? Biometrics inherently also provide information that lead to identity.	Contributions needed		
5.8	5.1	Unidentified	Insert diagram on biometric profile including the terminology	Contributions needed		
5.9	5.2.1	Unidentified	What is the definition of compromise?	Comments needed	Added Content to Section 6 including Definition	5/14/06
5.10	5.2.1	Unidentified	Which levels do compromise actually affect and where does it need to be addressed based upon motivation of the attacker?	Contributions needed		
5.11	5.2.1	Unidentified	Contradict ourselves in the document based upon the discussion and insertion of the physical and behavioral section of the report.	Comments needed		
5.12	5.2.1	Unidentified	When talking about compromise you must address credential compromise and system compromise.	Contributions needed		
5.13	5.2.1	Unidentified	How does compromise relate to the different levels of security?	Contributions needed		
5.14	5.2.1	Mr. Burr	It makes more sense to talk about the characteristics of biometrics and less time talking about password systems.	Comments needed	Added explanation to section 5.1 (see Issue 5.16)	
5.15	5.2.1	Mr. Burr	How can biometrics be effectively combined with other authentication mechanisms?	Contributions needed		
5.16	5.2.5	Mr. Burr	Need a sentence to address why password mechanisms are directly called out and compared to biometric secrecy.	Contributions needed	Added explanation to section 5.1	5/13/06
5.17	5.3	Dr. Cambier	Section doesn't adequately discuss image and static biometric	Contributions needed	Changed of section title to "Properties of Dynamic Biometric Technologies".	5/17/06
5.18	5.3	Mr. Podio	Introduce role of multi biometrics	Contributions needed	Added Subsection 7.4.3	5/17/06

5.19	5.3	Mrs. Valencia	Insert diagrams about the architectures	Contributions needed	Added into Section 7	5/16/06
5.20	5.5	Unidentified	Insert schematic of remote e-authentication of biometric system as it relates to the biometric process.	Contributions needed		
5.21	5.5	Mr. Burr	Compromise of biometric database and local database needs consistency which the discussion of compromise above.	Comments needed		
5.22	5.5	Dr. Cambier	It is not addressed that central database systems prevent duplicate enrollment.	Contributions needed		
5.23	5.6	Mrs. Markowitz	Would like to see the Web Services Model added to the Report	Contributions needed		
5.24	General	Mrs. Markowitz	Would like to see the "Template Adaptation" Function introduced	Contributions needed		

Section 6 – Critiques

6.1	General	Mrs. Tilton	This section needs to use the Issue or Challenge template.	Comments needed		
6.2	General	Unidentified	What is the correct order of the Critiques?	Comments needed		
6.3	6.1	Unidentified	What is the need to address integrity v. secrecy?	Comments needed		
6.4	6.1	Mr. Hapeman	What is the true challenge with compromise and revocation? Is it the fact that biometrics can be compromised...or is it finding a way to revoke them?	Contributions needed		
6.5	6.1	Mr. Modi	Where does revocation initiated by the user come in?	Contributions needed		
6.6	6.1	Mr. Burr	What is the need to report a lost smart card if the biometric is public information?	Contributions needed		
6.7	6.2	Unidentified	Add lead into sensor spoof section as what is covered there.	Contributions needed		
6.8	6.2	Unidentified	Move the detail of the level of attacks and details about it should be noted, but maybe not in the document itself maybe as an annex.			

6.9	6.2	Unidentified	The offsetting fact of a second factor needs to be discussed at the end of section 6.2	Comments needed		
6.10	6.3	Mr. Triglia	The SOF takes into consideration more than just the FAR	Contributions needed		
6.11	General	Mrs. Tilton	Need a coherent discussion of the issue and display the findings, this section is not going to be resolved by the time the report is completed.	Contributions needed		
6.12	6.3	Unidentified	What is the required entropy of the different levels?	Contributions needed	FMR's defined in Section 7.2.4	5/17/06
6.13	6.3	Mr. Burr	Need to have expensive 3 rd party tests to determine what the actual FAR tests are	Comments needed		
6.14	6.4	Mr. Beatson	Disagreed with the statement that revocation is "not applicable" to biometrics. This is not consistent with the documents intent to say that some biometrics CAN be secrets.	Scrub team will review document for consistency	Statement was removed. Content is aimed to discuss all aspects for consideration	5/14/06
6.15	6.4	Mr. Triglia	ACBio work is the right answer for proving security mechanism was used. There should be changes to BioAPI to support ACBio.	Contributions needed		
6.16	6.43	Mr. Beatson	Do we want to mention key generation from templates?	Contributions needed	Addressed slightly in section 6.5.3 "Key Management"	5/17/06
6.17	6.5	Mrs. Markowitz	4th paragraph is confusing	Scrub team to move to section 5	Redundant content, removed	5/12/06
6.18	6.5	Unidentified	Should move Table X to an annex	Scrub team to review and possibly move to annex	Moved to Annex	5/15/06
6.19	6.6	Unidentified	We should differentiate between requirements for templates and images (from the user perception angle). We should note that a compromise of security results in a privacy issue.	Comments needed		
6.20	6.6	Mr. Hapeman	Should Remove discussion about RSA	Comments needed		

Section 7 – Threats, Vulnerabilities and Models

7.1	General	Mrs. Tilton	Need coherent explanation of threats and countermeasures (Show to Jeff Stapleton)	Contributions needed		
7.2	General	Mrs. Tilton	Need detailed additions to the threat model	Contributions needed		
7.3	General	Unidentified	The enrollment process is not covered in this document. It needs to be added to both the architecture and threats sections. (this is not unusual, both PAM and GCS-IS are missing issuance)	Contributions needed	Added content to both Section 5 and Section 7	
7.4	General	Mrs. Markowitz	The group was reminded that general IT attacks were not identified. This document should cover threats unique to biometrics.	Contributions needed		
7.5	7.3	Unidentified	The document needs more in Analysis of Architectures. We need to add a (brief) description of architecture to the matrix at the end.	Contributions needed	Added Content and Diagrams to this affect in 7.3	5/17/06
7.6	7.5	Unidentified	Need short examples to show dynamic biometrics and rename to Illustrated Examples	Contributions needed		

Section 8 – Recommendations

8.1	General	Mrs. Tilton	Need recommendations for the next draft of NIST 800-63 to be released in the summer. Specially, assessing the appropriate use of biometrics at the four levels of OMB 04-04	Comments needed		
-----	---------	-------------	---	-----------------	--	--

Section 9 – Future Work

9.1	General	Mrs. Tilton	Need recommendations on future work	Comments needed		
-----	---------	-------------	-------------------------------------	-----------------	--	--

Annex

A.1	General	Mr. Young	Need recommendations on what content is appropriate for the Annex	Comments needed		
-----	---------	-----------	---	-----------------	--	--