

M1/06-1062

Date: 9 December 2006

Results of M1 Letter Ballot M1/06-0966 - New Project Proposal Biometric Performance Testing and Reporting - Part 7

	<u>Voting Members</u>	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>ABSTAIN</u>	<u>NO RESPONSE</u>	<u>COMMENTS</u>
1	3M/AiT	1				
2	ATMEL	1				
3	Authenti-Corp	1				
4	Aware, Inc.	1				
5	Bearing Point				1	
6	Biocom	1				
7	Biometric Associates	1				
8	Biometric Foundation	1				1
9	Bioscrypt, Inc.	1				
10	Booz Allen & Hamilton Inc	1				
11	Cogent Systems				1	
12	Computer Sciences Corporation (CSC)	1				
13	Crossmatch Technologies	1				
14	Daon	1				
15	EDS	1				
16	Fujitsu Laboratories				1	
17	Geometrix	1				
18	ID Technology Partners, Inc.	1				
19	International Biometric Group LLC	1				
20	L1 Identity Solutions	1				
21	MITRETEK SYSTEMS	1				
22	Motorola Inc.	1				
23	National Biometrics Security Project (NBSP)	1				
24	NIST	1				2
25	OSS NOKALVA	1				
26	Precise Biometrics	1				
27	Purdue University				1	
28	Recognition Systems				1	
29	Retica Systems	1				
30	SAGEM MORPHO INC				1	
31	Underwriters Laboratories	1				
32	U.S. Army Biometrics Task Force (BTF)	1				
33	United States Dept. of Homeland Security	1				
34	United States Dept. of State	1				
35	UPEK	1				
36	West Virginia University	1				
		30	0	0	6	

## **Comments**

### The Biometric Foundation:

Comment TBF 1: Clause 2.2; Technical reports are not normative, so this one should not “normatively” reference anything. Just delete “normatively” from the second sentence.

Comment TBF 2: Clause 2.6; change to “... relevant INCITS M1.5 meetings.”

Comment TBF 3: Clause 3.4.2; change to “Drafts of this technical report...”

Comment TBF 4: Clause 2.7; someone needs to flush all the old proposals that we use as templates so we will have a “target date” instead of “target data.”

Comment TBF 5: Project title; this project calls itself a technical report, but the cover page indicates it is to be Part 7 of a standard. Is this permitted under INCITS rules?

Comment TBF 6: Clauses 2.8, 3, 3.2, 3.3, 5; should the words “technical report” be used in these clause headings in preference to “standard”?

Comment TBF 7: Clause 5; on the assumption that this TR will include information on dimensions of various physical test environments, would it be better to indicate “both” rather than just “SI”?

<b>Comments on Letter Ballot M1/06-0966:</b> Biometric Performance Testing and Reporting - Part 7: Framework for Testing Methodologies for Specific Environments	Date: 9 December 2006	Document: M1/06-0903
--	-----------------------	----------------------

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Member	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of Comment (general, editorial, tech (major), tech (minor))	Comment (Justification for Change)	Requested Change or Rationale	Proposed Editors Disposition
NIST 1	Type of Technical Report		ge	There are two types of technical reports described in the INCITS RD2 : those approved and published by INCITS as INCITS Technical Reports (TRs); and those approved and published by INCITS and registered with ANSI as ANSI TRs (both are type DT). INCITS and ANSI TRs are not subjected to consensus by public review before approval. Action is taken by the INCITS Executive Board but ANSI INCITS have more visibility than INCITS TRs. The technical report developed for INCITS approval with ANSI registration will have the designation "ANSI INCITS" (See INCITS RD2 5.11.)	<b>Change the type of TR to ANSI TR</b>	
NIST 2	Title in cover page and page 1	te		Reflect in the project proposal the type of TR. We propose ANSI TR.	<b>Change Title (Cover page and in the second page (2 times)) to:</b>  "Project Proposal ANSI Technical Report - Information technology - Biometric Performance Testing and Reporting - Part 7: Framework for Testing Methodologies for Specific Environments of Biometric Systems"	
NIST 3	1.2	ed		Include INCITS m1 approval date	Replace Date to: "December 14, 2006"	
NIST 4	1.3	ed		INCITS M1 submits the project proposal to INCITS	Replace proposer to: "INCITS M1"	
NIST 5	2.1	ed		Project Type	This is a DT project – delete "N" Replace "INCITS Technical Report" by "ANSI Technical Report"	
NIST 6	2.2	te		Project type.  Technical reports are informational or tutorial in nature. See RD 2 - 5.11	Replace "INCITS Technical Report" by "ANSI Technical Report" Delete the second sentence	
NIST 7	2.7	Title and statement		As indicated in RD2 clause 5.11 "INCITS and ANSI TRs are not subjected to consensus by public review before approval action is taken by the INCITS Executive Board"	Change Title "Target Data for Submission to INCITS Executive Board"  Replace "It is estimated that the draft	

<b>Comments on Letter Ballot M1/06-0966:</b> Biometric Performance Testing and Reporting - Part 7: Framework for Testing Methodologies for Specific Environments	Date: 9 December 2006	Document: M1/06-0903
--	-----------------------	----------------------

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Member	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table /Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of Comment (general, editorial, tech (major), tech (minor))	Comment (Justification for Change)	Requested Change or Rationale	Proposed Editors Disposition
					document would be ready for submission to INCITS for Milestone 4 processing (Initial Public Review) in June 2007.”  By  It is estimated that the draft document would be ready for submission to the INCITS Executive Board in June 2007”	
NIST 8	3.1	te		The TR will not include testing but testing procedures	In the first sentence add “procedures” or “methodologies” or descriptions” or “as appropriate after the word “testing”	
NIST 9	3.1 - 1 <sup>st</sup> sentence	ed		Missing word	Replace “outside scope” by “outside the scope of 1602D parts”	
NIST 10	3.1 3 <sup>rd</sup> sentence	ed		Refer to INCITS TR	Delete the word “domestic” twice  Remove the second instance of “domestic”	
NIST 11	3.1 last sentence			Technical reports are informational or tutorial in nature. See RD 2 - 5.11	Replace “define” by “describes”	
NIST 12	3.3.3	te		This is not applicable to a TR	Replace current statement by : “N/A”	
NIST 13	3.4.2	te		The development target is a TR	Replace “standard” by “technical report”	
NIST 14	4.1	ed		As the project proposal acknowledges, there are existing performance testing methodology national and international standards	List the approved parts of 1602D and ISO/IEC 19795-1. Include full number and title of each part.	
NIST 15	4.2	ed		Could list ongoing projects only	Include only ongoing projects from the list. Leave out the approved standards listed in 4.1	