

Task Group M1.2 (US TAG to SC 37, WG 2) (draft)comments on WD 24708, BIP

Date: Sep. 19, 2004 Document: ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 37 WD 24708

US	Introduction	Para. 5	Ed	Use of “ISO/IEC 8824” may cause confusion between the intended standard, ISO/IEC 8824-1, and the obsolete standard, ISO/IEC 8824.	Change “8824” to “8824-1”.	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ US	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type Ed of com- ment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB The wrong document is listed as the standard for the Packed Encoding Rules.	Proposed change by the MB Change “ITU-T Rec. X.680 ISO/IEC 8824” to “ITU-T Rec. X.691 ISO/IEC 8825-2”.	Proposed Editors Disposition	
US	Introduction	Para. 14	Ed	Current text is not sufficiently clear.	Change: “Clause 14 specifies the exchanges for BioAPI Registry updating when devices are added or removed in a remote system.” To: “Clause 14 specifies the exchanges for updating the BioAPI Registry when devices are added or removed in a remote system.”		
US	Introduction	Para. 16	Ed	Current text is not sufficiently clear.	Change: “Clause 16 specifies the ASN.1 type supports event notification.” To: “Clause 16 specifies the ASN.1 type that supports event notification.”		
US	Introduction	Para. 21	Ed	The name give for BIP is incorrect (“Exchange” should be “Interworking”), and it is not sufficiently clear at this point in the document what functions are being referred to by “the functions”.	Change: “Biometric Exchange Protocol” To: “Biometric Interworking Protocol” Also, change “the functions”, to “the BioAPI functions”.		

	1.1	Para. 1	Ed	Use of “command” is inconsistent with previous term (“request”) used for the same item.	Change “command” to “request”.		
	1.10	Para. 1	Ed	This is the first time in the body of the document that “BIR” is being used, so it should be spelled out.	Change “BIR”, to, “Biometric Information Record (BIR)”.		
	2.1	Note	Ed	The current text is not sufficiently clear.	Delete the word, “only”.		
	4.3	Para.1	Ed	The current text could be made clearer by using the same terminology that was used in subclause 2.2.	Change: “BIP real system: a computer system that ...”		

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial – For technical comments, please indicate whether your comment is a MAJOR or MINOR technical comment.

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory.

Task Group M1.2 (US TAG to SC 37, WG 2) (draft)comments on WD 24708, BIP

Date: Sep. 19, 2004 Document: ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 37 WD 24708

1	2	(3)	4	5	To:	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition
	6.2.3	Para. 1	Ed	Typographical error	Change "fig4" to "fig 4".	
	6.2.4	Figure 7	Ed	Minor inconsistency with other tables	Center the second line of the table footer.	
	8.2	Note 1	Ed	The current text is not sufficiently clear.	Change: "... is sent to and conflicts with the UUID of a device on another system." To: "... is sent to another system and conflicts with the UUID of a device on that system."	
	8.2	Note 2	Ed	Typographical error	Change "BloAPI" to "BioAPI".	
	8.3	Para. 1	Ed	Typographical error	Change "BIOAPI" to "BioAPI".	
	10.2.2.1	Para. 1	Ed	Typographical error	Change "recept" to "receipt".	
	10.2.2.2	Para. 1	Ed	The entire subclause is not sufficiently clear, but especially "and providing any necessary response for the challenge/response establishing authentication".	Reword the paragraph so that it is more comprehensible.	
	10.2.3.1	Para. 1	Ed	The first sentence is not sufficiently clear.	Change: "Each system is configured with an identification of the installed BSPs and devices to which its remote access policy determines are to be available for use by remote applications. " To: "Each system is configured with the identification of the installed BSPs and devices to which its remote access policy permits use by remote applications. "	
	10.2.3.2	Table 1	Ed	The entries in column s 1 and 4 of Table 1 are mismatched starting with the row whose value in column 1 is "BioAPI_FunctionAttach".	Change the entries in column 4 so that they correctly reflect the clauses in which the items in column 1 are defined.	
	10.2.3.2	Table 1	Te	BioAPI_FunctionAttach and BioAPI_FunctionDetach are	Either define BioAPI_Function and	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial – For technical comments, please indicate whether your comment is a MAJOR or MINOR technical comment.

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory.

Task Group M1.2 (US TAG to SC 37, WG 2) (draft)comments on WD 24708, BIP

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
				present in Table 1, but are not defined in clause 15.	BioAPI_FunctionDetach in clause 15 or remove them from Table 1.	
MB¹	10.2.3.2 Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Table 1 Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note	Le Type of com- ment ²	BioAPI_QueryUnits, BioAPI_QueryBFPS and BioAPI_PresentIdentityOperation are defined in clause 15, but are missing from Table 1.	Add BioAPI_QueryUnits, BioAPI_QueryBFPS and BioAPI_PresentIdentityOperation to Table 1.	Proposed Editors Disposition
	10.2.3.3.1	Example	Ed	It is unclear as to what is meant by, "no exchangeable devices".	Clarify what is meant by "no exchangeable devices".	
	10.2.2.3	Example	Ed	The current text is not sufficiently clear.	Change "and no others", to "and no other messages".	
	10.2.3.4	Para. 1	Ed	It is unclear what this subclause is saying.	If this subclause is saying the same thing as 6.1.4, either delete this subclause, or replace it with 6.1.4 which is more clearly worded.	
	10.2.3.5	Para. 1	Ed	The current text is not sufficiently clear.	Change: "Provided support for these messages has been agreed by the peer," To: "Provided that support for these messages has been agreed to by the peer,"	
	10.3.1	Para. 1	Ed	The current text is not sufficiently clear.	Change: "Messages resulting from the invocation by an application of a BioAPI function requiring interworking with a BSP form request response pairs." To: "Messages resulting from the invocation by an application of a BioAPI function that requires interworking with a BSP form request response pairs, except for event notifications."	
	10.3.2	Para. 1	Ed	The current text is not sufficiently clear.	Change "... and the application requesting ...", to "... and identifies the application requesting ...".	
	10.3.3	Para. 1	Ed	The current text is not sufficiently clear.	Change: "The BioAPI API functions that produce these messages," To: "The BioAPI functions that produce BIP	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial – For technical comments, please indicate whether your comment is a MAJOR or MINOR technical comment.

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory.

Task Group M1.2 (US TAG to SC 37, WG 2) (draft)comments on WD 24708, BIP

Date: Sep. 19, 2004

Document: ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 37 WD 24708

					messages,".	
1	10.3.4.2	Para.(3)	Ed4	The current text is not sufficiently clear.	Change: (6)	(7)
MB¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	"In accordance with BioAPI, the "Capture" message is blocking (but may time-out), in relation to other capture messages from other remote systems (to the same BSP), or resulting from BioAPI_Capture from local applications." To: In accordance with BioAPI, the "Capture" message is blocking (but may time-out) in relation to other capture messages from other remote systems (to the same BSP), and in relation to BioAPI_Capture from local applications.	Proposed Editors Disposition
	10.3.4	Note	Te	The BIP state diagram referred to in this paragraph would be very useful if one were available.	Define the BIP state diagram.	
	10.4.1	Note	Ed	The current text is not sufficiently clear.	Change the 2 nd sentence to make it more intelligible.	
	10.4.2	Para. 1	Ed	Typographical error	Change "BioAPI API" to "BioAPI" for consistency with such usage in the rest of the document.	
	12.1	Para. 1	Te	BIP-Message should be extensible in order to easily support future additions to the BioAPI in a backward compatible manner.	Add an extension marker (...) to the end of definition of BIP-Message.	
	15	Para. 2	Ed	The text should be consistent with similar usage in the rest of the document.	Change "invocation and returns", to "requests and responses".	
	15	Para. 3	Ed	The current text is not sufficiently clear.	Change "also included that does not", to "also included; it does not".	
	15	All paragraphs	Te	Consideration should be given to use of type extensibility wherever appropriate, so as to allow for easier support of future extensions to the BioAPI and BIP.	Add extension markers (...) as appropriate to all definitions of type SEQUENCE.	
	Annex F	C	Ed	Clause numbers are wrong.	Change clause number prefix from "C" to "F".	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial – For technical comments, please indicate whether your comment is a MAJOR or MINOR technical comment.

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory.